

## REVISED

**Subject: Minutes of the Pre-Proposal Conference: Hiring of Services of “Engineering, Design & Construction Supervision (EDCS) Consultants – (Cluster- South-I), (Cluster- South-II), (Cluster- South-III), (Cluster- North), (Cluster- Centre)**

A pre-proposal conference of the shortlisted firms, for hiring services of “Engineering, Design & Construction Supervision Consultants” for rollout of Company’s interventions in 1800 villages of districts named hereunder, grouped in following geographical based Packages/Clusters, was held on April 22, 2024 at Conference Room of Punjab Rural Municipal Service Company (PRMSC), 5<sup>th</sup> Floor, KD Plaza, M.M. Alam Road, Gulberg-III, Lahore. The meeting was chaired by the Chief Operating Officer, PRMSC attended by the officials of the Company & representatives of the shortlisted consultants either through physical presence or virtually via “Zoom” Platform, as per list attached at Annex – I. The purpose of the pre-proposal conference was to provide clarifications on queries/questions raised by the participating representatives of the consultants on Request for Proposal (RFP) Documents and Terms of Reference (ToR) for respective package/cluster, to facilitate them in preparation of effective and efficient technical and financial proposals:

Package/Cluster		Districts
1.	Central	Jhang, Chiniot, Bhakkar, Pakpattan
2.	North	Mianwali, Chakwal, Sargodha, Khushab
3.	South – I	Rajanpur, Rahim Yar khan
4.	South – II	Muzaffargarh, Multan, D.G. Khan
5.	South – III	Lodhran, Bahawalpur, Bahawalnagar

### **Proceedings of the conference:**

2. The proceedings started with welcome remarks by Chief Operating Officer, PRMSC followed by introduction by the participants. The chair concisely explained the Terms of Reference (ToRs) elucidating thereby the scope related to Engineering, Design and Resident Construction Supervision of Infrastructure Development related to water supply and sanitation services in 1800 villages of selected districts, mentioned hereinabove. He also gave a brief overview of the company's scope under World Bank's assisted “Punjab Rural Sustainable Water Supply & Sanitation Project” and the current status of its ongoing and planned project activities.

3. He further emphasized to achieve the following objectives of the consultancy contracts that would be awarded through the procurement process under discussion:

- (i) Identification of sites for the respective work and conducting feasibility studies for the water supply, sanitation and solid waste management interventions ensuring 100% solid waste through recycling, composting and management of residual waste,

- (ii) Preparation of detailed Environment and Social Safeguard Documents i.e., Environmental and Social Management Plans (ESMPs), Initial Environmental Examination (IEE) / Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA), Resettlement Action Plan (RAP) / Abbreviated Resettlement Action Plan (ARAP) under the World Bank guidelines and Punjab Environmental Protection Department,
- (iii) Preparation of operational design and business model to provide technical and operational support by assisting the respective village's water and sanitation services provider in (i) improving water and sewerage services to customers utilizing the additional asset base created in the selected revenue villages; (ii) improving technical and commercial efficiency of the water utility, sanitation, solid waste management operations; (iii) enhancing human resource management and productivity; (iv) ensuring full cost recovery and financial sustainability of the respective villages' water and sanitation service provider; (v) conducting gap analysis and design a business and operational model for municipal services for water supply, and sewerage services; (vi) designing an overall integrated rural management solution; and (vii) designing a mechanism for forecasting of return on investment for the Government.
- (iv) Detail Designs, preparation of Bill of Quantities, Sub-Scheme Documents (PC-Is), Bidding Documents and Construction Supervision of the entire sub- projects via detailed Topographic Surveys, authentication of technically suitable and hydraulically viable water supply and sewerage systems (100% solid waste through recycling, composting and management of residual waste), socio-economic and engineering surveys, and
- (v) Specialized services during Construction phase as Resident Supervision.

4. Thereafter, the shortlisted consultants were invited to present their queries for clarification by the Company's Technical Team. The Consultants were also advised that besides asking queries during the meeting, they could also ask clarification on any question subsequent to the Pre-proposal Meeting within seven (07) days for ensuring clarity and avoiding confusion while submitting their Technical & Financial Proposals. It was clarified that PRMSC would respond to all queries from prospective bidders in the form of Minutes of Pre-Proposal Meeting without referring/disclosing identities of the consultants.

5. The following table provides all queries by the consultants and replies made thereof by PRMSC.

Queries		Remarks/Replies
1.	It is stated in RFP at ITB 2.4 that the Client will provide the following inputs, project data, reports, etc., to facilitate the preparation of the proposal  i) Project sites coordinates ii) List of Tehsils	All the related information has already been made public at Company's website which can be accessed at following link:  <a href="https://prmsc.punjab.gov.pk/tenders">https://prmsc.punjab.gov.pk/tenders</a>

	<p>iii) List of Revenue villages Kindly provide the data for our reference.</p>	
2.	<p>At Section 7 viz. Terms of Reference, of RFP Document for the Packages/Clusters: Central and North, four (04) settlements mentioned therein whereas in 53.1(a) there are three batches mentioned.</p>	<p>There is a confusion in understanding. The Section 7 of RFP Document illustrates the Terms of Reference (ToRs) of the assignment wherein tehsils names and number of villages have been provided.</p> <p>Whereas, the section 53.1 (a) pertains to the Payment Mechanism whereby it is given that the consultant shall complete the assigned task i.e., submission of feasibility reports covering total number of allocated villages of respective cluster/package under the contract, in three batches during the period of nine (09) months.</p>
3.	<p>GCC &amp; ITC 16.2: It is mentioned that Price Adjustment Provision is applicable to remunerations.</p> <p>We understand that price adjustment is applicable to remunerations for duration exceeding 18 months. Please confirm?</p> <p>Kindly elaborate the formula and the indexes for which price adjustment will be applied for the remuneration rates.</p>	<p><b>Yes.</b></p> <p>The remunerations against time-based component/activities of the contract are subject to price adjustment exceeding 18 months' duration.</p> <p>The related formula and indices are duly mentioned at the Section 8 viz. Special Conditions of Contract, Clause 50.3.</p>
4.	<p>Data Sheet Clause 14.1.2, 14.1.3:</p> <p>Minimum Man-months (MM) for Key staff are mentioned and also states that "the above staff-months are indicative only; the firms should make their own assessment and suggest staffing input as per their proposed methodology".</p> <p>We understand that MM for Key Experts shall be taken minimum as mentioned under this clause and MM for Non-Key Staff can be increased or decreased as per Consultant's Methodology. Please clarify?</p>	<p>The minimum number of person-months in respect of Key Staff that is required for efficient and effective execution of the tasks as per the scope of assignment are, essentially provided in the RFP Document enabling the consultants to cost their Financial Proposal resourcefully.</p> <p>The staffing requirements, envisaged for key as well as non-key staff, are expressly defined in Section 7 viz. Terms of Reference of RFP Document. Nonetheless, the referred staffing requirements are indicative, and the shortlisted consultants are liberty to propose their technical/administrative staff under categories of key and non-key staff, for accomplishing their tasks of the assignments ingeniously in addition to the given staff, while being mindful of the fact the selection process that has been employed entails both Quality (Technical) and Cost (Financial) Aspects of the proposed methodology. The cost is directly proportional to the number of staff and their person-months allocation.</p>

5.	<p>Clause 21.1: Point system for evaluation of Key Experts is mentioned under this clause with points and number of positions.</p> <p>We understand that CV of only Key Expert positions as mentioned under this clause are required to add in our proposal as it will only be evaluated. For Non-Key positions, we understand that these are required to be added in the agreement, we can provide the detail/CV of Non-Key Experts at the time of agreement if the project is awarded to the firm.</p>	<p><b>Yes.</b></p> <p>The evaluation of key staff's credentials will be executed applying the evaluation criteria defined at Clause 21.1. of Section 2 viz. Instructions to Consultants - Data Sheet of RFP Document, based on their CVs prepared as per the prescribed format namely, FORM TECH 6, provided in Section 3. Technical Proposal – Standard Forms, of RFP Document.</p>
6.	<p>ITC 21.1, ToR Section 4.1: Point system for evaluation of Key Experts and indicative time allocation of staff is mentioned under these clauses.</p> <p>The number of Key Experts mentioned under ITC 21.1 for evaluation does not meet with the number of staff mentioned in Staffing under ToRs for Cluster; Central, South-II &amp; South-III, i.e., in Central Cluster 4 numbers of Design Engineers (Water) are required in Staffing, however, only 2 will be evaluated as per Criteria ITC 21.1.</p>	<p>Inadvertent typographical errors in RFP Documents for Packages/Clusters namely; Central, South-II &amp; South-III have occurred.</p> <p>Necessary corrections have been made and being conveyed as an Addendum to respective Package/Cluster's RFP Document. The Addendums may be perused for clarity and amendments therein may be noted for proposals preparation.</p>
7.	<p>Form FIN-4: Breakdown of Reimbursable Expenses are mentioned in the form with detail of several items.</p> <p>i) It is mentioned Trial Bores, Geotech Investigations &amp; ERS for each Revenue Village. However, the number of tests under each Revenue Village is not clear and will create confusion while quoting and evaluating during bidding and at execution stage. We suggest fixing the number of tests per Village for bidding purposes and the actual number can be charged during execution.</p> <p>ii) In addition, Trial Bores will affect the submission timelines. We suggest adding these in the Contractors scope and the Consultant will review the design for any change if needed.</p> <p>iii) The detail of each item with numbers are fixed and cannot be changed.</p>	<p>The costing parameters/heads in the referred form, are indicative and exemplary. It is underpinned that the shortlisted consultants are mandated to propose an effective and efficient technical implementation methodology in their Technical Proposal as to how they shall execute the desired scope of services. Accordingly, the costing of Financial Proposal is based on the proposed methodology and hence, it is prerogative of the consultant to cost each and every activity/component, aligned and commensurating with their implementation methodology, under Form FIN 4 viz. Breakdown of Reimbursable Expenses.</p>
8.	<p>FIN-4 Note It is mentioned that "Consultant is required to establish a separate design office</p>	<p>It has been made pre-requisite in the referred Form that the selected Consultant is required to</p>

	<p>&amp; construction supervision office in Lahore and in each Tehsil”.</p> <p>We understand that Design Office is required at Lahore only and not in each Tehsil. Please confirm?</p>	<p>establish a separate design office &amp; construction supervision office in Lahore and in each Tehsil for housing their Key and Non-Key Experts.</p>
9.	<p>Section-7, ToR: It is mentioned that “All the relevant details along with coordinates are in Annex – I”.</p> <p>Annex-I is not available with RFP document.</p>	<p>All the related information has already been made public at Company’s website which can be accessed at following link:</p> <p><a href="https://prmsc.punjab.gov.pk/tenders">https://prmsc.punjab.gov.pk/tenders</a></p>
10.	<p>Clause 3.1 (i) c: It is mentioned that “Prepare a detailed GIS base map based on satellite imagery (0.6 m resolution) which will be acquired from an authentic source”.</p> <p>Acquisition of Satellite Imagery requires time and well-defined parameters to get from the authentic source so it can be fixed for all consultants. Conversely, our project locations are of village levels which consist of scattered habitations, our scope can well fulfill the required tasks on imagery from available sources. It will enable consultants to start and complete their tasks well in time and save resources which can be used on other activities. The authenticity of image can be verified during the field activity. Please review and confirm the use of free source satellite imagery with field verification so all the bidders prepare this task with same detail and can be compared equally during evaluation. Please review and confirm?</p>	<p>The defined scope as per ToRs, has to be complied with which means GIS based mapping, based on satellite imagery (0.6 m resolution),acquired from <u>an authentic source</u>, is necessary.</p>
11.	<p>TORs Section 3.1 (i) c</p> <p>it was mentioned to prepare a detailed GIS based map on Satellite imagery (0.6m resolution).</p> <p>Will the satellite imagery be provided by the client or not?</p>	<p><b>No.</b></p> <p>It is in the scope of consultant to acquire it. for <u>an authentic source</u>.</p>
12.	<p>ToRs Section 4, Staffing</p> <p>The qualification required for the GIS expert was M.Sc. in Space Sciences and not the GIS &amp; Remote Sensing. MS GIS &amp; Remote Sensing degree is more appropriate than the Space Sciences for this Key Expert</p>	<p>The Client shall be evaluating the credentials of the proposed key experts as per the qualification and experience criteria defined in the Terms of Reference. Having said that, the consultants are at liberty to propose the professional against key experts which they consider most suitable, mindful of the evaluation/scoring parameters for a Technical Proposal, as defined at Clause 21.1.</p>

		of Section 2 viz. Instructions to Consultants - Data Sheet of RFP Document.
13.	<p>Clause 3.3, para-3 It is mentioned that “The Engineering, Design and Construction Supervision Consultant shall be extending their technical support in all the phases of MIS System development, deployed, maintenance and reporting through it, to the Client”.</p> <p>We understand that development of MIS is the responsibility of Client. However, the Consultant will share all the available data of the project to MIS team for updating their database. Please confirm?</p>	<p><b>Yes.</b></p> <p>The Company is developing its MIS through a third party which will be available to the EDCS Consultants. Nonetheless, since the MIS System is being developed, the Company will also be securing inputs of EDCS Consultants in defining segments related to project implementation, field execution and reporting for making it a robust system.</p>
14.	<p>Clause 4, Staffing Criteria with qualification and experience of all Experts are mentioned under this clause.</p> <p>i) For almost all Key Experts, Master Degree is required as qualification. It is requested to allow the Bachelors with more experience and Masters can be advantage with more points in the evaluation criteria i.e. Bachelors + 20 years or Masters + 15 years. Please review?</p> <p>ii) We understand that overall experience will be calculated after graduation. Please clarify?</p>	<p>First query is responded at Sr. No, 12 hereinabove.</p> <p>For all Engineering disciplines specific experience shall be count from passing year of graduation while additional marks will be given for master’s degree.</p>
15.	<p>Section 6, Facilities arranged by Consultants It is mentioned that “The Consultant has to arrange residence and station the focal persons at Lahore and field offices in all tehsils.</p> <p><b>Clarification:</b> We feel there is no need to arrange the residence for focal person as also has no provision in the Reimbursables. Please review?</p>	<p>Related clarifications are provided at Sr. No. 7 &amp; 8 hereinabove. The same may be perused collectively.</p>
16.	<p>Section 2. Instructions to Consultants E. Data Sheet Clause 16.1(3); Investigations and surveys;</p> <p>As per the ToR, it is difficult to ascertain the exact quantity and extent of work required for surveys, studies and investigation etc. works. Therefore, it is requested an allocation of a Provisional Sum to cater Survey,</p>	<p>All the related data with respect to Project sites coordinates, List of Tehsils, and List of Revenue villages, have been made public. It is incumbent upon the Consultants to satisfy themselves about the sufficiency of information besides collecting any external information from their own credible sources, for efficiently and resourcefully costing their financial proposal.</p>

	Investigations, etc., that will enable a level playing field to all bidders.	Unfortunately, the request for Provisional Sums, cannot be acceded to, being unjustified.
17.	<p>B -Consultant's Experience, Section 3. Technical Proposal – Standard Forms, List only previous similar assignments successfully completed.</p> <p>Kindly consider the inclusion of successfully completed or ongoing projects that align with the current project requirements. This will underscore the consultants' capability to handle similar ongoing projects.</p>	The requirement is clear and lucid. Changing the evaluation criteria after issuance of RFP Document on requests of a consultant(s) is not healthy consideration, avoiding any objection for favouring a consultant(s).
18.	<p>Section 7. Terms of Reference, Non-Key Staffing Qualification Requirements;</p> <p>We understand that consultants are required to submit non-key CVs that fulfills the specified qualification criteria after being successfully ranked first in the proposal. Please confirm.</p>	<p><b>Yes.</b></p> <p>Only CVs on prescribed format, of key experts, are required as part of Technical Proposal while details of non-key staff will required at implementation stage and contract stage.</p>
19.	<p>4.1: Indicative time allocation of staff, Section 7. Terms of Reference; Indicative time allocation of staff Expected inputs for key and non-key experts.;</p> <p>Does inter adjustment of Key positions man months is allowed by keeping the total sum intact? Kindly confirm.</p>	Response at Sr. No. 4, is referred which is explanatory for understanding.
20.	<p>The allocated Construction Supervision period of 20 months (<b>cluster North</b>) appears to be impractical, given the significant number of Revenue Villages and settlements to be covered. Specifically, the number of Revenue Villages is 291. The ambitious timeline could potentially compromise the quality of work and pose challenges in accomplishing tasks efficiently. We respectfully request an extension of the project duration for at least four years to ensure optimal delivery of the project's objectives.</p>	<p>It is prerequisite for shortlisted consultants to propose their implementing methodology being mindful of the required timelines for respective component of the assignment, as per ToRs, and accordingly plan their staffing and working, resourcefully to achieve the desired outputs/ objectives, within desired time.</p> <p>It is reiterated that efficient Work and Staff Planning carry relative scoring weights for technical qualification of a consultant.</p>
21.	<p><b>Project Duration:</b> The allocated Construction Supervision period of 20 months (<b>cluster south</b>) appears to be impractical, given the significant number of Revenue Villages and settlements to be covered. Specifically, the number of</p>	As responded above.

	<p>Revenue Villages is 347. The ambitious timeline could potentially compromise the quality of work and pose challenges in accomplishing tasks efficiently. We respectfully request an extension of the project duration for at least four years to ensure optimal delivery of the project's objectives.</p>	
22.	<p>Section 2. ITC and Data Sheet Data Sheet 11.1; Participation of Key Experts and Non-Key Experts in more than one Proposal is not permissible</p> <p>According to the Data Sheet, participation of Key and Non-Key Experts in more than one Proposal is not permissible. However, the required Key Expert person No. is 26 and the Non-Key Expert person no. is 92.</p> <p>It is the Consultant's concern that there is a high risk of being proposed in more than one Proposal during recruitment of suitable and qualified Expert(s) in the limited pool. Therefore, it is desirable to allow individual expert including Key &amp; Non-Key Expert position to be proposed in more than one Proposal.</p>	<p>The restriction has been applied by the Company conscious of the fact that assignments in multiple geographical regions shall be implemented simultaneously, having the required staffing/experts available on full-time basis, as per required staffing inputs given in ToRs for respective package/cluster.</p> <p>The evaluation of Technical Proposal will be made strictly in compliance with the requirements of RFP Document and it is advised that they should be adhered to.</p>
23.	<p>Section 2. ITC and Data Sheet Data Sheet 16.4; The Financial Proposal should state local costs in the Client's country currency (Pak Rupees only); Section 8. Conditions of Contract and Contract Forms (Time Based) III. Special Conditions of Contract</p> <p>52.1 The currency [currencies] of payment shall be in Pak. Rs. (PKR)</p> <p>According to the Data Sheet and SCC clauses, the Consultant is instructed to prepare Financial Proposal in Pak. Rupee currency only and the payment to the Consultant will only be made in Pak. Rupee currency.</p> <p>Please clarify whether other currency (ies) including USD and/or EURO is not applicable and/or acceptable.</p>	<p>The proposal shall be in Pak. Rupee. While the US Dollars or direct payment to the International Consultants shall be applicable as per world bank regulations and can be discussed at the time of Contract Negotiations</p>
24.	Section 2. ITC and Data Sheet	Yes.

	<p>Data Sheet 10.1</p> <p>The Proposal shall comprise the following: For FULL TECHNICAL PROPOSAL (FTP): 1st Inner Envelope with the Technical Proposal:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(1) Power of Attorney to sign the Proposal</li> <li>(2) TECH-1</li> <li>(3) TECH-2</li> <li>(4) TECH-3</li> <li>(5) TECH-4</li> <li>(6) TECH-5</li> <li>(7) TECH-6</li> <li>(8) TECH-7 Code of Conduct</li> </ol> <p>Section 3. Technical Proposal – Standard Forms CHECKLIST OF REQUIRED FORMS</p> <p>TECH-8 Sexual Exploitation and Abuse (SEA) and/or Sexual Harassment (SH) Performance Declaration</p> <p>According to the Data Sheet, Technical Proposal shall comprise from TECH-1 to TECH-7. However, TECH-8 is indicated in the Checklist of required forms.</p> <p>Please clarify whether the Consultant shall prepare TECH-8 form.</p>	
25.	<p>Data Sheet 11.1</p> <p>it is explicitly stated that the participation of Key Experts and NonKey Experts in multiple proposals is not allowed. Therefore, considering the significant staffing demands of the project, we respectfully seek permission to utilize the same personnel across multiple projects/packages/cluster, both in key and non-key roles.</p>	<p>Response at Sr. No. 23, is referred which is explanatory.</p>
26.	<p>4.1: Indicative time allocation of staff:</p> <p>The services will require the following person months of national consultant inputs for each cluster. The document specifies a requirement for the services of national experts. However, there are international firms that are qualified to bid on this project. Could you kindly clarify whether these</p>	<p>An International/foreign consultant may propose, either national or international staff, giving due consideration to the fact that relevant experience of proposed expert in the region having working level fluency in local language(s)/knowledge of local culture or administrative system, government organization, etc., shall be a preference and hence, shall be valued as per the scoring criteria</p>

	international firms are restricted from providing international experts?	defined at Clause 21.1 of Section 2 viz. Instructions to Consultants - Data Sheet, of RFP Document.
27.	<p>Section 2. Instructions to Consultants E. Data Sheet in ITC Reference 14.1.1: Shortlisted Consultants may associate with (a) non-shortlisted consultant(s)</p> <p>Could you please share the list of non-shortlisted consultants to form a consortium who will fulfill the requirement of the team?</p>	The related information could be accessed and perused at <a href="https://prmsc.punjab.gov.pk/tenders">https://prmsc.punjab.gov.pk/tenders</a> , as part of EOI Evaluation Results for respective Package/Cluster, made public thereby.
28.	<p>Section 4.1 - Indicative time allocation of staff</p> <p>In the Terms of Reference, the expected time input for the non-key experts is higher than 1400 person-months in each Cluster. Could you confirm these estimations?</p>	Response at Sr. No. 4, is referred which is explanatory for understanding.
29.	<p>Section-2: Instruction to Consultants; Data Sheet; Clause-11.1; It is mentioned that: Participation of Key Experts and Non-Key Experts in more than one Proposal is not permissible.</p> <p>It is understandable that Key &amp; Non-Key Experts should not be the same in more than one proposal, however at the proposal stage details of non-Key staff shall not be provided.</p>	In continuation of response provided at Sr. No. 22, it should be noted that based on parallel implementation of similar services in multiple geographical based clusters, the restriction on replication of staff, in more than one clusters, is equally applicable for both key and non-key staff, either during proposal submission or at contracting/ implementation stage.
30.	<p>Section-2: ITC; Data Sheet; Clause-17.4; Technical Proposal Submission</p> <p>“Copies”, Can be true original print of “Original Proposal” or has to be the photo copy of the “Original Proposal”?</p>	Clause 17.4 at Page 19 of Section 2 viz. Instructions to Consultants (ITC), of RFP Document is self-explanatory and is referred.
31.	<p>Section-3: Technical Proposal; Standard Forms, Tech-1 “Technical Proposal Submission Form”</p> <p>Shall client accept scanned/digital signatures of authorized person on Tech-1 and all necessary technical proposal documents?</p>	It is preferred that CVs should originally signed. Nonetheless, in case of use of digital signature, it must be ensured that authorization/ confirmation of the proposed expert for inclusion of his/her CV with digital signature, in Technical Proposal, through an email, should be submitted with Technical Proposal as proof. This condition will also be applicable in case CV of an expert is being signed by an authorized representative of a consultant.
32.	<p>Section-3: Technical Proposal; Standard Forms, Tech-6 “CV”</p>	As explained above.

	<p>1. Can authorized person sign the CV of on behalf of key experts?  2. Shall client accept scanned/digital signatures of authorized person or expert?</p>	
33.	<p>Section-3: Technical Proposal; Standard Forms, Tech-7 “Code of Conduct for Experts”</p> <p>It is mentioned that: The Consultant shall initial and submit the Code of Conduct form as part of its Proposal.</p> <p>1. Can authorized person sign the code of conduct on behalf of key experts?  2. Shall client accept scanned/digital signatures of authorized person or expert?</p>	<p>Response at Sr. No. 31, is referred which is explanatory for understanding.</p> <p>With regards to the query apropos acceptance or use of digital/scanned signature of an authorized consultant’s representative submitting Technical &amp; Financial Proposals, is should be noted that each and every page of Technical and Financial Proposals, are obligatory to signed, in original, by the representative of the consultant, authorized under an authority letter to be provided with the Technical Proposal, to do so.</p>
34.	<p>Section-3: Technical Proposal; Standard Forms, Fin-1 “Financial Proposal Submission Form”</p> <p>Shall client accept scanned/digital signatures of authorized person on Fin-1 and all necessary financial proposal documents?</p>	As explained above.
35.	<p>South-I Section-7: ToRs; Man-Months of “IoT Design Expert”</p> <p>Required regarding sum of ManMonths. Total Man months of lot Design Expert in RFP for Cluster South I, need correction...6 =&gt; However it is mentioned 9.</p>	An inadvertent typo error is corrected through Addendum which is available at Company’s website.
36.	<p><b>Reference:</b> South-I Section-7: TROs; Total Man-Months of Non-Key Experts</p> <p>Required regarding sum of ManMonths. Total Man months for Nonkey need correction...1,462 =&gt; However it is mentioned 1,465. Correction shall also lead for correction of Total Man-Months i.e., 1,702.</p>	As responded above.
37.	<p><b>Time Extension</b></p> <p>Recognizing the paramount significance of this project for the province, we kindly request an extension of the submission deadline by a minimum of two weeks. This additional time will empower us to create a comprehensive and meticulously prepared</p>	Sufficient time extension has been provided and related information is shared and made public at Company’s website.

	proposal for a project of such immense national importance	
38.	Will the tendering of each cluster commence upon the completion of tendering documents for each cluster? For example, will the tendering for the first cluster begin after 4 months, for the second cluster after 7 months, and for the third cluster after 10 months?	<p><b>Yes.</b></p> <p>The tendering process is contingent upon completion of preceding task, in respective of each geographical location, as per the timelines given in Payment Terms at Clause 53.1 of Section 8 viz. Conditions of Contract and Contract Forms.</p>
39.	Is the Defects Liability Period (DLP) included within the 32-month timeframe, or is there a separate duration allocated for it? Additionally, what is the duration of the DLP?	<p>It is clear as per ToRs that EDCS Consultant shall inspect the completed work periodically during the defect liability period <u>within the term covering the Consultant's Agreement</u>. The standard defect liability period of civil works contracts is one year.</p> <p>It may be noted that the periodic inspections of works, required to be executed during defect liability period is optional if any such requirement occurs. Moreover, the contracting nature of Resident Construction Supervision Phase is time-based, therefore, the consultant may have to retain very minimal staff for inspecting/supervising occasional works, if happened during defect liability period.</p>
40.	TORs section 3.4: it was mentioned to prepare the operation & business model. It was not clearly defined the business model duration either we have to prepare 10 years, 15 years or 25 years operation & business model.	It will be explained to the contracted consultant when the related task shall commence.
41.	<p>As per the recent 2023 population census, it only provides a limited amount of data and it is only available at the district level and not at tehsil or village level.</p> <p>In this situation, will the client provide the updated detailed census data and other data necessary for the design?</p>	<p>It is consultant's responsibility to define their Technical Proposal acquiring all the related data, from either source i.e., primary and/or secondary. Also, during the execution, collection/ gathering of data from any of the aforesaid source, will fall within the consultant's contract/assignment domain.</p> <p>The Client is not having access to any related data, however, could give reference letter for collection of data by the contracted consultant during execution.</p>
42.	The timeline for submission of documents indicates that the feasibility study, Operational and business design model, detailed engineering designs and PC-1 is set	The respective assignments' timelines are very critical and shall be stringently evaluated while establishing the technical qualification of a shortlisted consultant. It is therefore advised that

	to be submitted in the first 3 months, it is mentioned that the time duration is too short to complete this task. So, it is requested to extend this timeline to at least 6 months.	the consultants should resourcefully propose their implementation methodology having careful consideration to the cost and its related correlation in the selection process.
43.	ITC (Instructions to the Consultants) Section, 2.4:  It was mentioned that the client will provide the Project's Site Coordinates, List of Tehsils, list of revenue villages to facilitate the preparation of proposals. This data has not been provided yet and there is very short time left in the proposals submission.	All the related information has already been made public at Company's website which can be accessed at following link:  <a href="https://prmsc.punjab.gov.pk/tenders">https://prmsc.punjab.gov.pk/tenders</a>
44.	TORs Section 3.1 (i) f,  It was mentioned to prepare the situational analysis report about the existing conditions, current growth trends.  Regarding the situational analysis report of the existing conditions, will the authentic data be provided by the client by the authentic authorities like municipal committees or the consultant have to acquire the data by itself from the concerned authorities.	The execution of task and accessing/acquiring data from credible source, is consultant's exclusive responsibility.
45.	<b>Reference:</b> TORs Section 3.1 (ii) b  It was to go for the identification of the sustainable water sources.  Will the machinery & the tools required for the water source identification be facilitated by the client or not.	No.
46.	TORs section 3.1 (ii) n  It was mentioned to prepare the detailed plantation plan for each village and that plan should take into account the geography & climatic conditions of each site.  Will the authentic real climatic data be provided by the client or the consultant will have to consult the Metrological Department by itself for acquiring the data.	The execution of task and accessing/acquiring data from credible source, is consultant's exclusive responsibility.
47.	It is proposed that due to huge set of activities in design phase particularly in planning and feasibility stage time for completion till final PC-I and start of bidding stage, instead of 12	The respective assignments' timelines are very critical and shall be stringently evaluated while establishing the technical qualification of a shortlisted consultant. It is therefore advised that

	months may be extended to 14 months and resident supervision be reduced to 18 months keeping overall 32 months' time as same. It will be very rational and realistic approach.	the consultants should resourcefully propose their implementation methodology having careful consideration to the cost and its related correlation in the selection process.
48.	For the position of Groundwater Expert, the required degree is Master Degree or above in Civil Engineering or relevant discipline. We understand that an Agri Engineer having M.Phil. in Water Resources Management and Ph.D. in Engineering Hydrology may qualify for the position of Groundwater Expert. Please confirm.	Response to query at Sr. No. 12 is referred.
49.	Please share with us the name of villages/ locations for Cluster South III.	All the related information has already been made public at Company's website which can be accessed at following link:  <a href="https://prmsc.punjab.gov.pk/tenders">https://prmsc.punjab.gov.pk/tenders</a>
50.	Regarding the Request for Proposal document for the project mentioned in Subject, in Section 7, "Terms of Reference," specifically under "ENGINEERING DESIGN AND CONSTRUCTION SUPERVISION CONSULTANT (EDCS) Cluster Central Part 1. Introduction: After the EOI documents, table of revenue village settlements have been changed from "3 (three)" districts to "4 (four)" districts but the numbers of batch of villages have remain same due to this rectification in Section 7, "Terms of Reference," under Part 7. Performance Monitoring and Reporting – Table 1: Reporting Requirements from Consultants and in Section 8. "Conditions of Contract and Contract Forms (Time Based)" under Part 3. Special Conditions of Contract. When grouping up the batch of villages for each tehsils, may content of batch of villages comprise from different tehsils for each number of batches? Is this situation going to be a problem on supervision phase of the project?	There is no change/difference about the numbers of districts, for respective geographical based package/ cluster. The number/ distribution of selected districts in each package/ cluster, is unique and contains no relation with other package/cluster.  With regards to the batching of villages, the response provided at Sr. No. 2 is referred which is explanatory for understanding.
51.	Regarding to Request for Proposal document for the project mentioned in Subject 7, "Terms of Reference," specifically under "ENGINEERING DESIGN AND CONSTRUCTION SUPERVISION CONSULTANT (EDCS) Cluster Central in Section 2, "Instructions to Consultants," Part	All the related information has already been made public at Company's website which can be accessed at following link:  <a href="https://prmsc.punjab.gov.pk/tenders">https://prmsc.punjab.gov.pk/tenders</a>

	E. Data Sheet, A. General table, ITC Reference of 2.4 we request Project Site's Coordinates, List of Tehsils and List of Revenue Villages for the preparation of the proposal.	
52.	Regarding to Request for Proposal document for the project mentioned in Subject 7, "Terms of Reference," specifically under "ENGINEERING DESIGN AND CONSTRUCTION SUPERVISION CONSULTANT (EDCS) Cluster Central in Part 5. Duration of the Contract, Construction Supervision has been identified as 20 months. In the light of this, does it have DLP in this duration and if has, how many months does it take?	Response to query at Sr. No. 39 is referred.
53.	In this regard, we kindly request clarification on whether there is a requirement for: i. Number, percentage and timeline of batch of villages. ii. Project Site's Coordinates, List of Tehsils and List of Revenue Villages, Condition of DLP in Supervision	All the related information/responses related to queries, are given in the table.
54.	Terms of Reference/Item 3 "Scope of Consultancy Services"/ Sub item 3.1(ii) "Feasibility Study"/(n) ; The Consultant shall plan detailed plantation plan for each village.  In staffing (Key and Non-Key Experts), there is no position of Horticulturist to carry out this task. Please clarify.	The minimum staffing requirements is defined in ToRs. The consultant may propose the related methodology and expertise to achieve the desired output, either through the required staffing or adding a related expert, if considered necessary, while being mindful of the fact that staffing has an impact on the cost and costing carries a considerable factor in determining highest ranked/most advantageous consultant as per the Quality & Cost Based Selection method
55.	Data Sheet/ Item 2.4; Following data will be provided by the Client in order to facilitate the preparation of proposal:  i) Project Site's Coordinates ii) List of Tehsils iii) List of Revenue Villages  The mentioned documents have not been received in e-mail dated 08.04.2024. Please provide.	All the related information has already been made public at Company's website which can be accessed at following link:  <a href="https://prmsc.punjab.gov.pk/tenders">https://prmsc.punjab.gov.pk/tenders</a>
56.	Data Sheet/ Item 11.1; "Participation of Key and Non-key experts in more than one proposal is not permissible"	Responses at Sr. No. 22, 25 & 29, are referred which are explanatory.

	<p>Please refer to positions of Non-Key experts/ Site Inspectors = 60 Nos. for one cluster. It is not possible to nominate all the Site Inspectors at proposal stage because some of them will be hired in case of award. We understand that all the Non-Key staff will be TBN and will be nominated later in case of award during contract negotiations. However, Key Staff will not participate in more than one proposal. Please confirm our understanding.</p>	
57.	<p>Terms of Reference/Item 3 “Scope of Consultancy Services”/ Sub item 3.2(xxv) ; Inspect the Completed work periodically during the defect liability period..... notified defects by the contractors.</p> <p>The overall duration of the project is 32 months (9 months for design+3 months for bidding documents + 20 months for construction supervision) which does not include services during defect liability period. Please provide the duration of defect liability period and staff requirement for the same.</p>	Response to query at Sr. No. 39 is referred.
58.	<p>Section 7 “Terms of Reference/ Item 5 “Duration of the Contract”; Man-Month Input of Quantity Surveyor</p> <p>3 months have been proposed for one position during supervision phase, however, in our opinion it should be extended to full duration of construction supervision i.e. 20 months.</p>	Response to query at Sr. No. 4 is referred.
59.	<p>Section 7 “Terms of Reference/Item 4.1 “Indicative time allocation of Staff”; Number of Staff and their time allocation during Construction Supervision Phase</p> <p>In RFPs following configuration of staff is mentioned during construction Supervision phase:  Resident Engineer = 1 No./Tehsil  Assistant Resident Engineer = 2 Nos. /Tehsil  Quantity Surveyor= 1 No./Tehsil for 3 months  Site Inspectors = Minimum 4 Nos./Village and maximum 6 Nos./village</p>	Response to query at Sr. No. 4 is referred.

	<p>However, keeping in view the number of villages and anticipated quantum of work in each village, we suggest the following configuration:</p> <p>Chief Resident Engineer= 1 No. for each Cluster  Resident Engineer = 1 No. for every 100 villages  Assistant Resident Engineer = 1 No. for every 25 villages  Site Inspectors = 1 No. for every 3 villages  Quantity Surveyor = 1 Nos. for every 100 villages for complete duration of construction Supervision  Lab Technician = 2 Nos. for each Tehsil</p>	
60.	<p>Part II/Section 8 “Conditions of Contract and Contract Forms</p> <p>We understand that design phase is Lumpsum and Construction Supervision is Time based. Please confirm.</p>	Yes.
61.	<p><b>Reference:</b> Section 4 “Financial Proposal-Standard Forms”/ Form Fin 4 “ Breakdown of Reimbursable Expenses” Geotechnical Investigations</p> <p>Keeping in view the quantum of work and to keep all the consultants on the same page, it is suggested to consider on of the following two options:</p> <p>i) The cost of detailed geotechnical investigations should be borne by the Contractor during construction supervision phase considering possibilities of the design variation due to change in locations.</p> <p>ii) The client may fix a cost against provisional sums for geotechnical investigations.</p>	Response to query at Sr. No. 16 is referred.
62.	<p>Keeping in view the No. of villages and quantum of work, the design staff seems to be on lower side. It is requested to provide some provision for additional staff as Non-Key.</p>	
63.	<p>Keeping in view the Eid Holidays and quantum of work in each proposal, it is requested to extend the submission deadline for two weeks.</p>	Sufficient time extension has been provided and related information is shared and made public at Company’s website.

64.	<p>An ambiguity is witnessed in 4.1 of TOR of the RFP's, Key Experts and Non-Key Experts needed by the client shall be Nationals. This limitation clearly eliminates foreign experts of Foreign Consultants which clearly discourages them for considering of their Experts (Foreign) in the proposal and is a discriminatory condition as the bid was open for both Foreign and National Firms. We request you to review the RFP document as per our input and allow both Foreign and National Experts for the positions of all Key Experts.</p>	Response to query at Sr. No. 26 is referred.
65.	<p>Section 53.1(a) of the Special Conditions of Contract,</p> <p>Design stage is allocated 30% and the supervision stage is allocated 70%. Considering that the main expense will be attributed to key experts, we suggest the deletion of predefined payment percentages and propose that payments shall be based on actual man-months executed, or alternatively, that the design phase be allocated at least 40% of the payment.</p>	The request cannot be acceded to, as the respective term has been defined after due considerations and Company's requirements.
66.	<p>Page 35 of the RFP,</p> <p>Two persons are listed for the positions of Design Engineer (Water Supply Expert), Sanitation Expert/PHE Engineer, Groundwater Expert and Resident Engineer (Civil). However, on page 89 of the RFP, it states that there are four persons for the same positions. Could you please clarify the exact number of persons required for these positions, whether it is two or four?</p>	The numbers and requirements defined in Section 7 viz. Terms of Reference, take precedence and should be followed. In this regard, Addendums published at Company's website may be perused.
67.	<p>Team Leader position requires a Master's degree or higher in Civil Engineering, with a specialization in Water Supply &amp; Waste Water Engineering, Public Health Engineering, Environmental Engineering, or a related field. However, considering the construction supervision phase and the need for a seasoned leader to helm the resident supervision team, we propose relaxing the educational requirement to a Bachelor's degree in Civil Engineering, complemented by at least 20 years of relevant experience. This adjustment will allow us to consider</p>	Response to query at Sr. No. 12 is referred.

	highly experienced and qualified candidates with a proven track record in the field.	
68.	16.2. Price Adjustment	Applicable
69.	<p>Additional Staffing</p> <p>Design: There is an extensive work load, tremendous design works to be conducted and to be finalized within very limited time. Kindly reconsider adding additional staff to the design phase.</p> <p>Construction Supervision: There will be around 300/500 villages within the Clusters. The man months given for 1 Team leader and Assistant Resident Engineers is very limited, given the fact that there will be many Contractors to supervise on site. Considering the multitude of contractors poised for on-site supervision, it is imperative to augment the senior staff presence to ensure thorough oversight throughout the construction supervision. Thus, kindly increase the number of Senior Staff on site for proper supervision throughout the construction phase.</p>	Response to query at Sr. No. 4 is referred.
70.	<p>53.1. Payments</p> <p>The Cost of Contract</p> <p>Advance Payment: There is no advance payment for this Contract. The design works need a lot of mobilization of staff, on-site surveying, sampling, geotechnical studies, hydrogeological studies etc. The Consultant will have to face a cash flow difficulty till the midst or end of the design period incase no advance payment is given taking into account the amount of expenditures to be incurred before any payment is received. Kindly reconsider giving an advance payment.</p> <p>Break-down of payment: In the payment schedule the Consultant will receive 1,5% of the Contract value after the inception report. This specified amount is not feasible as per justifications given above. Kindly consider changing the payment plan as fx: Inception Report: 10% of the total project value, 30% design, %60 Construction Supervision</p>	<p>Advance payment shall be made 15% against unconditional bank guarantee.</p> <p>In the payment schedule the Consultant will receive 5% of the Contract value after the approval of inception report, rest of the payment schedule will adjusted accordingly.</p>

	ODBM: Please be informed that there is no payment allocated for the ODBM Study.	
71.	53.1. (e) The accounts  Kindly confirm that the Client can make a payment directly to an international bank, for the international Companies, if needed.	Yes.
72.	<p><b>Solid Waste Component</b> The Solid waste component is referring to Complete Solid Waste and Liquid Waste Management. It is deemed necessary that this component is elaborated to be able to give a more accurate quotation as the Consultant. Kindly elaborate how much technical work will be done for Solid waste management. Is it the Consultants responsibility to conduct geotechnical studies for the landfill sites? Is the Consultant going to prepare bidding document for the SW component? Is the Consultant going to perform Construction Supervision Services and supervise the Contractors for the SWM component? Kindly elaborate?</p> <p><b>Water Sampling</b> The necessity for a critical volume of water sampling to analyze various water sources is evident. Moreover, we contend that a single sampling event may not suffice, particularly in delineating water sources comprehensively. To ensure meticulous sampling, the Consultant must undertake water collection activities over a span of at least a year, thereby guaranteeing accurate identification of resources and adequate assessment of water flow. It is imperative to acknowledge that the Client will share existing data for these samples, even if sourced from other clients, mitigating the risk of insufficient sampling due to time constraints. Kindly confirm,</p> <p><b>Land Acquisition</b> Please confirm that land acquisition responsibilities will lie with the Client. Should the Consultant identify a location for a reservoir, that the Client cannot promptly approve or get approval for, delays may occur, potentially resulting in variation orders</p>	<p><b>Solid Waste Component – Yes</b></p> <p><b>Water Sampling – all the data collection is an exclusive responsibility of the consultant.</b></p> <p><b>Land Acquisition – if required, yes.</b></p> <p><b>Utility Mapping and Mapping – The standards and/or their use, has to be proposed by the shortlisted consultant in their methodology as part of Technical Proposal.</b></p>

	<p>due to elapsed time. Kindly confirm that VO might be issued for such instances.</p> <p>Utility Mapping and Mapping Kindly elaborate your surveying standards for water and sewerage. Is there a mapping set of standards for scale, accuracy and sensitivity to be used for the field surveys to be performed?</p>	
73.	<p>Please be informed that Annex 1 and Appendices have not been received yet by the Consultants.</p>	<p>All the related information has already been made public at Company's website which can be accessed at following link:  <a href="https://prmsc.punjab.gov.pk/tenders">https://prmsc.punjab.gov.pk/tenders</a></p>
74.	<p><b>Reference:</b> section 4.1  (Indicative time allocation of staff), only national technicians (key and non-key) are mentioned. Since the short list is made up of several international companies, please clarify whether it is possible to consider non-national technicians in some team positions.</p>	<p>Response at Sr. No. 26, is referred.</p>
75.	<p><b>Reference:</b> Instructions to Consultants, Item 11.1,  it is explicitly stated that the participation of Key Experts and Non-Key Experts in more than one Proposal is not permissible. Considering the demanding requirements for the technical team (both in terms of the number of technicians and time-input), we kindly ask you to allow some of the technicians to be repeated in the teams proposed for the different clusters</p>	<p>Response at Sr. No. 23, is referred.</p>
76.	<p>Section 4.1 (Indicative time allocation of staff),  the time-input for the non-key experts is 1678 person-months. Please confirm this estimate.</p>	<p>Response to query at Sr. No. 4 is referred.</p>
77.	<p>Instructions to Consultants Item 16.4,  the Financial Proposal should state local costs in Pak Rupees only. Does this mean that payment for the contract will be made exclusively in Pak Rupees? Or do you accept that, although the proposal is stated in Pak Rupees, payment can be made in another eligible currency? Assuming this option is</p>	<p>Response to query at Sr. No. 23 is referred.</p>

	accepted, are payments obligatorily made on national territory (Pakistan) or is it possible to make payments abroad, since this is a joint venture of international companies?	
78.	<p>Clause 4, Staffing</p> <p>Criteria with qualification and experience of all Experts are mentioned under this clause:</p> <p>i) For almost all Key Experts, Master Degree is required as qualification. It is requested to allow the Bachelors with more experience and Masters can be advantage with more points in the evaluation criteria i.e. Bachelors + 20 years or Masters + 15 years. Please review? ii) We understand that overall experience will be calculated after graduation. Please clarify?</p>	Response to query at Sr. No. 14 is referred.

### **General Discussions:-**

6. The following guiding principles were also discussed: -
- i) While proposing methodologies, prime consideration should be given to the requirement defined in the scope of services (ToRs),
  - ii) Financial Proposal should be in a separate sealed envelope, otherwise the proposal would be declared non-responsive,
  - iii) The person who would be submitting the Technical & Financial Proposals should be properly authorized to do so and the power of attorney/ authorization in this regard, be provided in the respective proposals,
  - iv) Technical Proposals should be in properly binding form and consultants should refrain to submit proposals in clip folders,
  - v) No separate document, which would not be in properly binded (not spiral binding) with the Technical and/or Financial Proposals, would be considered in review/evaluation,
  - vi) No comments on budget or financial details be provided either in Hard and/or Soft Copies of the Technical Proposals, otherwise, the same would stand non-responsive,
  - vii) All pages of the Technical & Financial Proposals should be numbered, signed/initialed and stamped,
  - viii) Each position number of the required "Key Staff", as required in ToRs and ITC Data Sheet, should correspond to the same for the Key Experts in Form TECH-6 to be prepared by the consultants,

- ix) The consultants would be required to appropriately provide their Technical Approach & Methodology on **EACH** Component of the assignment, responding to ToRs and the evaluation parameters given at ITC Data Sheet;
- x) All implementing arrangements should be proposed comprehensively and the consultants must refrain from building any hidden cost(s) in their Financial Proposals. All the assumption should be explicitly expressed in quantifiable terms in respective proposals.

7. The meeting ended with a vote of thanks by the Chief Operating Officer re-assuring the integrity of the selection process.

**Annex – A**  
**LIST OF PARTICIPANTS**

<b>S.#</b>	<b>Names of Representatives</b>	<b>Designation/ Contact</b>	<b>Organization/ Service Provider</b>
1.	Mr. Ali Raza Rao	Chief Operating Officer (In chair)	PRMSC
2.	Mr. Jamil Ahmad	Chief Infrastructure & Development	PRMSC
3.	Mr. Muhammad Ahsan Khan	Manager Procurement	PRMSC
4.	Mr. Muhammad Umar Awais	Procurement Officer	PRMSC
5.	Mr. Iftakhar Rasool	Chief Engineer PHE Div.	Associated Consulting Engineers ACE
6.	Ms. Shazia Imtiaz	Chief BD	Associated Consulting Engineers ACE
7.	Mr. Naveen Zahra	BD Manager	Asian Consulting Engineers
8.	Mr. Atta Wazir	Geotech Engineer	Asian Consulting Engineers
9.	Mr. Nadeem Muhammad Qurashi	Head BD	Jers Consultancy
10.	Mr. Ghulam Farid	Head BD	EA/RHC
11.	Mr. Shahid Zafar	Manager BD	ES Consultants
12.	Mr. Asim Ghafoor	Manager Infrastructure	ES Consultant Pvt Ltd
13.	Mr. Abid Farooq	Design Eng. Infrastructure	ECSP
14.	Mr. Adeel Raiz	Technical Manager BD	ECSP
15.	Mr. Jawad Hussain	Sr. Manager	NDC
16.	Mr. Shaffey Rasheed Minhas	Sr. Engineer-PCD	NDC
17.	Mr. Muhammad Mohsin	Manager Proposals	MMP
18.	Mr. Muhammad Atif Younis	Jr Engineer	MMP
19.	Mr. Jahanzaib Chaudhary	CRE / Snr Engineer	Techno Consultant International
20.	Mr. Ali Ahtesham	Head Office Engineer	G3 Engineering Consultant Pvt Ltd
21.	Dide Ozdikmen	Representative	ALTER (Online)
22.	Ms. Iqra Batool	Proposal Engineer	SKAFS Consulting (Online)

23.	Cevre - Senem	Representative	Art (Online)
24	Nasir Ayub	Managing Director	Spectra Engineering Solutions (Online)
25	Ms. Saima Islam	Principal Engineer BD	NESPAK (Online)
26	Mr. Irfan	Ass. Manager BD	SKAFS (Online)