

Subject: Minutes of the Virtual Meeting – Expression of Interest for Engineering Design and Construction Supervision (EDCS) Consultants for PRSWSSP

Punjab Rural Municipal Services Company (PRMSC) has invited Expression of Interests (EOI) for Engineering Design and Construction Supervision (EDCS) Consultants for the following packages by advertising separate "Request for Expressions of Interest (REOI)" Notice. The individual package's REOIs and ToR are already available at PRMSC official website. As mentioned in the REOI Notices, a pre-fixed Virtual Meeting for all the packages, was held on 08th June 2023 through virtual platform namely "Zoom", for extending an opportunity to all the prospective Consultants, to obtain clarifications on the selection process besides giving them briefing about the mandate and objectives of the Company & the scope of services of the assignments. The Weblink, Meeting ID and Passcode were provided in the respective REOI. The meeting was attended by the officials/technical resource persons of PRMSC & representatives of potential Service Providers who chose to attend.

Proceedings of Meeting:

2. The Chief Executive Officer with the assistance of his team members, briefly explained the scope of the assignments which were duly made public in the form of Terms of Reference (ToR) of respective package, by uploading them on the website of the Company for free downloading. The uploading of ToR was duly referenced in the REOI Notice. Briefly the mandate, operations & functions of the Company, were also apprised for understanding of the Consultants.
3. The representatives of the Service Providers sought various clarifications which were addressed by PRMSC Team accordingly and are juxtaposed hereunder: -

Sr. #.	Questions/ Queries	Replies
1.	The Consultant is responsible for studying the possibilities of a Public-Private-Partnership (PPP) set up for operation and maintenance. In staffing (Key and Non-Key Experts) there is no position of PPP Expert to carry out this study.	Although at this stage of the selection process, the comments on the Terms of Reference (ToR) have not been invited, nonetheless, it is to clarify that this aspect of the assignment carries a very meager tasking and it has been envisaged that the Team Leader which a Consultant will be proposing, could be capable of to handle this part of the assignment without any difficulty being expert in the related field. Yet, the selection will be based on Quality & Cost Selection Method whereby Quality of a proposal will be carrying a sufficient weightage, therefore, it will absolutely dependent on the shortlisted consultant to propose team based on their understanding and methodology of the assignment which they would consider appropriate, while being mindful of the fact that cost will be carrying an important factor inn determination of highest ranked consultant, based on

Sr. #.	Questions/ Queries	Replies
		the combined scores of quality (technical) and cost (financial) of the proposal.
2.	The overall duration of the project is 32 months for design and supervision services which constitutes the consultancy assignment's period. Please provide the duration of defect liability period and staff requirement for the same.	<p>The duration of the consulting assignments in respect of each package and the staff requirements thereof, have been duly provided in the ToR. Whereas, whether the company would be requiring the services of the consultant during the defect liability period of the contractors whose contracts shall be intendent of the consultants' contracts, would be mentioned in Request for Proposal (RFP) Document.</p> <p>It has been envisaged that the Company's own team will be able to execute the defect liability period of the contractors' contracts.</p>
03.	Design duration of 12 months seems to be very less considering total number of villages in one cluster. It is requested to enhance the project duration for design services. We propose that design activities may be overlapped with construction supervision so that overall design duration may be extended to 24 months while keeping the total duration of 32 months.	<p>The Company considers, based on its pilot phase experiences, that the time allowed for the Designing tasks, is sufficient and consultants executing their tasks by efficiently planning & engaging their staff, can undertake the task with entire comfort.</p> <p>It is reiterated that at this stage of the selection process, ToR are provided only for guidance/understanding purpose, of the potential applicants for having an idea about the nature of services. Such clarifications shall be provided to the consultants to whom the RFP document shall be issued.</p>
4.	We understand that there is no scope related to wastewater treatment under Cluster-South-II. Please confirm.	The scope is same for all cluster.
5.	18 months have been proposed for these positions, however, in our opinion it should be extended to full duration of construction supervision i.e. 20 months. Keeping in view the total number of villages, number of supervision staff provided seems to be very less. It is requested to reconsider it during RFP stage.	<p>It is reiterated that at this stage of the selection process, ToR are provided only for guidance/understanding purpose, of the potential applicants for having an idea about the nature of services. Such clarifications shall be provided to the consultants to whom the RFP document shall be issued.</p> <p>Based on the selection method employed for the selection of consultants i.e. Quality & Cost Based Selection, the consultants shall be at liberty to propose whatever staffing period based on their understanding and methodology of the assignment which they would consider appropriate, while being mindful of the fact that cost will be carrying an important factor inn determination of highest ranked consultant, based on the combined scores of quality (technical) and cost</p>

Sr. #.	Questions/ Queries	Replies
		<p>(financial) of the proposal. The Company feels that the minimum staffing requirements envisaged in the ToR will be sufficient to handle the assignment/contract efficiently and effectively.</p> <p>However, the feedback is appreciated, and it will be reviewed before the issuance of the RFP document.</p>
6.	<p>There is some arithmetical error in total Nos. of provided Key Experts. It is requested to provide the actual no. of key expert.</p>	<p>It is reiterated that at this stage of the selection process, ToR are provided only for guidance/understanding purpose, of the potential applicants for having an idea about the nature of services. Such clarifications shall be provided to the consultants to whom the RFP document shall be issued.</p> <p>If there is any typo/arithmetical error in totaling, it will be corrected in RFP Document, The individual key staff numbers are duly given in ToR, which hold the precedence.</p>
7.	<p>We understand that the provided man-month input is for one person. Total man-month input will be multiplied by the no. of persons. Please confirm.</p>	<p>It is reiterated that at this stage of the selection process, ToR are provided only for guidance/understanding purpose, of the potential applicants for having an idea about the nature of services. Such clarifications shall be provided to the consultants to whom the RFP document shall be issued.</p>
8.	<p>It is mentioned that the deliverable of inception report will be submitted within 4 weeks after signing of contract. Keeping in view that number of villages, it is not possible to submit inception report within 4 weeks. It is requested to increase the time for submittal of inception report. Moreover, after 4 weeks (submission of inception report) there is no deliverable during remaining 7 months and at 8th month feasibility report for all village will be submitted. In our opinion, mode of payment/deliverables should be modified and segregated as first batch of villages submission at 3 months, second batch of villages at 6 months and third batch of villages at 9 months.</p>	<p>It is reiterated that at this stage of the selection process, ToR are provided only for guidance/understanding purpose, of the potential applicants for having an idea about the nature of services. Such clarifications shall be provided to the consultants to whom the RFP document shall be issued.</p> <p>However, it is commented that based on pilot phase experiences, the Company considers that the timelines tagged with the respective deliverables are realistic and consultants executing their tasks by efficiently planning & engaging their staff, can undertake the task easily.</p> <p>However, the feedback is appreciated, and it will be reviewed before the issuance of the RFP document.</p>
9.	<p>Repetition of design staff in different clusters may please be allowed.</p>	<p>It is reiterated that at this stage of the selection process, ToR are provided only for guidance/understanding purpose, of the potential applicants for having an idea</p>

Sr. #.	Questions/ Queries	Replies
		<p>about the nature of services. Such clarifications shall be provided to the consultants to whom the RFP document shall be issued.</p> <p>Nonetheless, it may be noted that the contract of each cluster/package shall be independent on other cluster/package's contract without having relation and relevance, and if a consultant is shortlisted for more than one clusters/packages and eventually also stands qualified for award of contracts for more than one cluster/package, the staff for each cluster/ package needs to be separate as similar assignments shall be in execution in parallel, in various clusters/packages. Overlapping of a staff in more than one cluster/package can hamper/affect the tasks and timelines of other cluster/package.</p>
10.	<p>In advertisement of Punjab rural sustainable water supply and sanitation project client mentioned for "firms interested to participate in a Joint Venture should submit all the required information as per above parameters in respect of each partner, which shall be assessed independently regardless of capacity/experience of the other partner". Kindly clarify if human resources shall also be evaluated independently for each firm?</p>	<p>The requirements to evaluate the EOI Response/profile of a Joint Venture, are expressly mentioned in the REOI Notice. Since the Company has received financing from the World Bank and is obligatory to follow World Bank's Procurement Regulations, therefore, the requirements about JV Participation have been defined in complete compliance with the World Bank's Regulations.</p> <p>It is further clarified that as per the industry practice, in joint venture formation, two or more consultants can make an association by either signing an intended or fully executed & registered Joint Venture Agreement, mentioning therein the roles and responsibilities of each partner, in detail. In such formation, the consultants are obligated to submit all the required information as per the evaluation parameters in respect of each partner, which are assessed independently regardless of capacity/experience of the other partner, being jointly & severely liable for the delivery of services, if contract is awarded.</p> <p>Therefore, the human resource capacity assessment of each joint venture partner, as required in REOI Notice, shall be made independently.</p>
11.	<p>Is it allowed to make JV with an international firm?</p>	<p>Indeed. It is prerogative of the consultants to form a Joint Venture as per their ease.</p>
12.	<p>There is no evaluation criteria mentioned in the EOI document. Kindly share the marking criteria for evaluation of EOIs.</p>	<p>The evaluation parameters have been duly provided in the REOI Notices. Primarily, The Company will be evaluating the provided explanations/ profile in respect of each evaluation parameter/criteria in terms of</p>

Sr. #.	Questions/ Queries	Replies
		<p>qualitatively. Therefore, it is advised that consultants should not bother about the quantification of quality assessment, they should provide specific material/details/ explanation related to each evaluation criteria precisely so that they could enhance their chances for shortlisting.</p>
13.	<p>As per Scope of Work in TOR 3.1 under planning sub-head (c) Client demand for GIS mapping based on satellite imagery of 0.6 m resolution. GIS mapping is as huge task and number of key experts and man months are less. Kindly increase the number of man months of GIS experts.</p>	<p>It is reiterated that at this stage of the selection process, ToR are provided only for guidance/understanding purpose, of the potential applicants for having an idea about the nature of services. Such clarifications shall be provided to the consultants to whom the RFP document shall be issued.</p> <p>However, the feedback is appreciated, and it will be reviewed before the issuance of the RFP document.</p>
14.	<p>As per Scope of work in TOR mentioned Linkage of project with MIS kindly clarify regarding development of MIS system development, maintenance. <i>The Engineering, Design and Construction Supervision Consultant shall be extending their technical support in all the phases of MIS System development, deployed, maintenance and reporting through it.</i> Shall the consultant also responsible for it's development? If yes then IOT experts are very less. Kindly increase their number and man months.</p>	<p>As above.</p>
15.	<p>IN TOR scope of consultancy services Sr. 3.1 sub head demographic and socio-economic data based on survey is required whereas key expert and survey team not mentioned in this regard.</p>	<p>As above.</p>
16.	<p>Eligibility Criteria & specific format for submission of application is not mentioned clearly. Please provide proper instruction/ client requirement for applications submission.</p>	<p>The matter of eligibility criteria has been replied to at Sr. No. 12.</p> <p>About specific format for submission of application, it is germane to mention that presentation is a subjective matter, and it varies from consultant to consultant. Every consultant intends to present their profile/ application in their way of presentation which they consider the appropriate, enhancing their chances to impress the client. Therefore, no specific format for submission of EOI profile/ application has been prescribed.</p>

Sr. #.	Questions/ Queries	Replies
		<p>The Consultants are at liberty to present their profile by presenting specific experience, strength, capacities etc., conscious of the evaluation parameters, in a best presentable form which they may consider appropriate.</p> <p>It is requested to refrain from submitting generic information/profile.</p>
17.	Can pre-qualified firms form a JV at the next stage (RFP)?	<p>It depends on whether such formation is allowed in the Request for Proposal (RFP) Document. Generally, it is not allowed at RFP Stage, therefore, all the consultants are encouraged to efficiently decide their participation at this stage of the selection process, providing a ease to the company to engage the best qualified consultants/JVs.</p> <p>It is very less likely that JV formation at RFP stage would be allowed.</p>
18.	Can a Firm/JV apply for more than one package?	<p>Indeed.</p> <p>A consultant or a JV, are at liberty to participate in as many as clusters/ packages. Nevertheless, they shall have to submit separate EOI Response/Application/Profile in respect of each Cluster/ Package by clearly mentioning the name of the respective Cluster/ Package on the envelope so that their application/profile should not get confused and mistakenly considered for some other cluster/package.</p>
19.	Will the consortium be evaluated as a whole or separately? If it is meant to be evaluated separately, what will be the synthesis?	<p>It is necessary to understand the difference between different types of association. There are generally three types of association as explained below, and the consultants could opt for anyone while fully mindful of the evaluation process:</p> <p>Joint Venture: In joint venture formation, two or more consultants can make an association by signing either an intended or fully executed & registered Joint Venture Agreement, mentioning therein the roles and responsibilities of each partner, in detail. In such formation, the consultants are obligated to submit all the required information as per the evaluation parameters in respect of each partner, which are assessed independently regardless of capacity/experience of the other partner, being jointly & severely liable for the delivery of services, if contract is awarded.</p>

Sr. #.	Questions/ Queries	Replies
		<p>Sub-consultancy: In sub-consultant association, two or more consultants can participate, and, in their profile, it has to be clearly mentioned as to who is the Lead Partner and who are sub-consultant partners. An explicit letter of association duly indicating the Lead Partnership, has to be submitted with the profile by each sub-consultant partner. In sub-consultant association, only the experience and capacity of lead firm/ consultant, is assessed.</p> <p>Consortium: In this association, two or more consultants can make a consortium and participate. However, in such formation, a consortium is given a particular name, and all the partners participate in a process under that name, therefore, it is mandatory that the consortium is legally registered with concerned registration authority(ies) under its given name and under that name, and each member of the consortium must be fulfilling the evaluation/selection requirements/ parameters on the corresponding percentage share which the member has agreed to deliver in their consortium agreement. Generally, the registration of consortium involves little legal difficulties, therefore, it is not preferred.</p> <p>Any of the above association arrangements should be clearly mentioned in Expressions of Interest Response and all the related documentation must be furnished with the responses.</p>
20.	Will CVs of staff be evaluated/ submitted at pre-qualification stage?	<p>It is explicitly mentioned in the REOI Notices that Specific CVs and nominations are not required at this stage of the selection process.</p> <p>It is an absolute prerogative of the consulting firm to present/submit their profiles/ responses in an efficient way of presentation which they would consider feasible for best and effective evaluation by the Client. They firms may opt to share CVs of their permanent staff and the experts which are on their panel. Nonetheless, the consulting firm shall have to submit the list having names, qualifications and experience of their adequately qualified and skilled staff, permanent/intermittent staff, pool of panel of experts as per the scope of work.</p> <p>The consultant's adequacy of having qualified and skilled staff; in either form i.e., permanent/ intermittent staff, pool of panel of experts, will be assessed based on</p>

Sr. #.	Questions/ Queries	Replies
		<p>brief explanation of named staff's qualification and experience statements.</p> <p>It may be noted that specific CVs and nominations considering the requirement given in Terms of Reference, are not required at this stage.</p>
21.	Is electronic submission (via email) of proposals allowed?	The consultant has to submit the expression/response/application/profile through by hand/postal/ courier.
22.	We understand that CVs of staff are not required at this stage and only a list of permanent and associated staff will be sufficient to add in the document. Please confirm?	As explained at Sr. No. 20.
23.	We understand that separate documents for each cluster will be submitted in hard form even if the formation of firm (single or in JV) will be same for each cluster. Please confirm?	<p>Yes.</p> <p>It is restated that a consultant or a JV, are at liberty to participate in as many clusters/ packages. Nevertheless, they shall have to submit separate EOI Response/Application/ Profile in respect of each Cluster/ Package by clearly mentioning the name of the respective Cluster/ Package on the envelope so that their application/profile should not get confused and mistakenly considered for some other cluster/package.</p>
24.	If the company participated at EOI stage as Single or in JV for different Clusters and submitted their documents and get shortlisted. Can the shortlisted members of consortium change their JV at proposal stage. Please clarify?	<p>As explained at Sr. No. 17.</p> <p>It is advised that consultants should be clear about their JV/association formation at this stage of the selection process and must not target for any such option for a later stage.</p>
25.	The last date for submission of EOI document is 20 th June 2023. This is large scale project and after getting clarification from pre-bid meeting, we will accordingly form our consortium as per project requirement in which multiple companies will be involved and required extensive documentation. It is requested to please extend the bid submission deadline to 7 th July 2023 considering the Eid holidays.	<p>Sufficient time has already been extended for submission of EOI Responses/Applications/ Profiles pursuant to the standard timelines that have been prescribed in the World Bank's Procurement Regulations.</p> <p>The Company and the Government of Punjab have made commitments with its International Development Partner to complete the related tasks in certain timelines. Owing to the said commitments, the Company is constrained to accede to any request apropos time extension for submission of EOI Responses/Applications/ Profiles.</p>

General Discussions:

4. In addition to above, the following principles of the selection process, were underpinned: -

The Consultants should read and understand the ToR with all clarity including evaluation. Besides they must be complete comprehension of the selection process employed,

Interested consulting firm(s)/ Joint Venture(s) must provide information indicating that they are qualified to perform above services (e.g. descriptions of similar assignments, value of previous assignments, experience under similar conditions, availability of appropriate professionals etc.),

The consultant should ensure that all submitted information is correct. A proposal submitted may be dropped at anytime up to award of work if significant omissions/errors are found in the information submitted by the consultant,

The person who would be submitting the response against the REOI, should be properly authorized to do so and the power of attorney/authorizations in this regard, be provided with the profile,

All the documents of profiles should be in properly binded form,

If the EOI Response consists of more than one volume, the applicant must clearly number the volumes constituting the EOI and provide an indexed table of contents for each volume,

Data Sheets of relevant (similar and specific experiences) assignments/works, duly substantiated, by the Service Provider(s)/ Joint Venture(s) members either completed or in progress, with the following details.

Name of the Project

Cost of the Project

Name and address of the Company

If case of association of Consultant(s), the type of association i.e. either JV or sub-contractor/consultant be mentioned clearly along with names and address of all the partners.

Services rendered along with the Start & Completion Date.

A Consultant, which was a partner in a previous joint venture(s), should furnish a statement providing details of work, component of works performed individually and its over-all share (percentage) in the works performed by the joint venture,

All pages of EOI Response should be numbered and stamped, ideally signed/initialed,

5. The meeting ended with a vote of thanks from the Chief Executive Officer.