



PUNJAB RURAL MUNICIPAL SERVICES COMPANY

(A Company registered under Section 42 of the Companies Act, 2017)



For the attention of Bidder's Authorized Representative

Name : Mr. Aman Ullah
M/S Haji Aman Ullah & Company
Address : H # 18/1, Block Z, Model Town, Dera Ghazi Khan

DEBRIEFING RECORD

Employer : **Punjab Rural Municipal Services Company (PRMSC)**
Project : **Punjab Rural Sustainable Water Supply & Sanitation Project (PRSWSSP)**
Contract title : Procurement Of Civil Works, South-III, Tehsil Rojhan (VILLAGES: Kotla Hassan Shah, Tariqabad, Saleemabad, Safdarabad, Mutfarq Mazari (Chak Mazari)
Contract Package-ROJ-02

Country : Pakistan
Loan No. : IBRD-92670
RFB No. : PK-LG& CD-366916-CW-RFB

In pursuance to the Notification of Intention to Award (Notification) issued to the bidder named above on 03 April 2024, notifying our decision to award the above contract to the following successful bidder, the above-named bidder submitted a request for "Debriefing" on 03 April 2024:

As per the Notification of Intention to Award (Notification), averred to above, the Standstill Period expired on the midnight of:

Date:	22-04-2024	Local Time:	15:00 hours
-------	------------	-------------	-------------

The request for Debriefing was received within the allocated dateline and pursuant to the provisions of the Notification of Intention to Award dated 03 April 2024, PRMSC provided the necessary debriefing as per the information that was shared vide aforesaid Notification dated 03 April 2024 to the following authorized representative of the bidder who requested the Debriefing, in person:

Name : Mr. Aman Ullah
Title/position : Owner

Following information was reiterated to the authorized representative of the bidder Notification of Intention to Award (Notification) dated 03 April 2024:

Bidders who submitted the bids which were evaluated

S #	Name of Bidder	Bid Prices as Read Out – Pak Rs.	Evaluated Bid Price – Pak Rs./Remarks
1.	M/s Zulfiqar & Brothers	260,004,639	259,731,509 (1st Lowest)
2.	M/s Haji Aman Ullah & Company	253,726,027	Non-Responsive (The Bidder did not fulfill the specific construction experience criteria as mentioned in Section-III "Evaluation and Qualification Criteria" of the bidding documents)

The authorized representative of the bidder was apprised the following reason(s) due to which their bid remained unsuccessful that were duly recorded in the Notification of Intention to Award (Notification) dated 03 April 2024:

Sr. No.	Reasons	RFB Clause Ref.
(i)	The debriefing session commenced as scheduled at the PRMSC office.	Section III - Evaluation and Qualification Criteria



PUNJAB RURAL MUNICIPAL SERVICES COMPANY

(A Company registered under Section 42 of the Companies Act, 2017)



<p>Manager Procurement initiated the session by stating the reason for M/s Haji Aman Ullah & Company's non-responsiveness to Work ROJ 02, as the bidder did not fulfill the specific construction experience criteria outlined in the Section III - Evaluation and Qualification Criteria which states:</p> <p><u><i>A minimum number of two (02) similar contracts, each with a value of at least Eq. PKR 251 million that have been satisfactorily and substantially completed as a prime contractor, joint venture member, management contractor or subcontractor between 1st January 2013 and bid submission deadline. The similarity shall be based on the physical size, complexity, methods/technology and/or other characteristics described in Section VII, Works' Requirements.</i></u></p> <p>Discussion ensued regarding the specific construction experience criteria and the documentation provided by M/s Haji Aman Ullah & Company.</p> <p>Manager Procurement explained to the contractor that the attached work orders provided by them were not considered valid evidence of meeting the criteria, as one work order was under the name of M/s Haji Aman Ullah & Company, while the other was under the name of M/s Amman Ullah Laghari.</p> <p>The representative from M/s Haji Aman Ullah & Company claimed that the original work of M/s Amman Ullah Laghari was actually completed by M/s Haji Aman Ullah & Company. They will submit a clarification letter from the executive engineer to support their claim.</p> <p>The Manager Procurement acknowledged the statement from M/s Haji Aman Ullah & Company, and after submission from the contractor, the matter will be presented to the competent authority for decision</p>	<p>4.2- Specific Construction & Contract Management Experience</p>
---	--

The authorized representative of the bidder was also updated that they can obtain further information related to the procurement process by accessing the World Bank's Procurement Regulations from their website at the link:

[Procurement Regulations for IPF Borrowers \(Procurement Regulations\)](https://policies.worldbank.org/sites/ppf3/PPFDocuments/Forms/DispPage.aspx?docid=4005)
[\[https://policies.worldbank.org/sites/ppf3/PPFDocuments/Forms/DispPage.aspx?docid=4005\]](https://policies.worldbank.org/sites/ppf3/PPFDocuments/Forms/DispPage.aspx?docid=4005)

The authorized representative of the bidder was also explained that they may wish to lodge procurement complaint in case of their unsatisfaction by taking guidance from the World Bank's related policies & procedures: "[How to make a Procurement-related Complaint](http://www.worldbank.org/en/projects-operations/products-and-services/brief/procurement-new-framework#framework)" [\[http://www.worldbank.org/en/projects-operations/products-and-services/brief/procurement-new-framework#framework\]](http://www.worldbank.org/en/projects-operations/products-and-services/brief/procurement-new-framework#framework) which provides a useful explanation of the process, as well as a sample letter of complaint, which obligates following essential requirements:

- 1) The bidder must be an 'interested party'. In this case, that means a Bidder who submitted a Bid in this bidding process, and is the recipient of a Notification of Intention to Award.
- 2) The complaint can only challenge the decision to award the contract.
- 3) The bidder must submit the complaint within the period stated in the Notification of Intention to Award.
- 4) The bidder must include, in their complaint, all of the information required by the Procurement Regulations (as described in Annex III).