



PUNJAB RURAL MUNICIPAL SERVICES COMPANY

(A Company registered under Section 42 of the Companies Act, 2017)



For the attention of Bidder's Authorized Representative

Name : Mr. Muhammad Asghar
M/S Ahmad & Co.
Address : 36-E, Architect Engineering Society, Lahore

Name : Mr. Khalid Mehmood
M/S Tayyab Manzoor Tarar
Address : Street No. 02, House No. 26, Shaheen Park, Sargodha

Name : Mr. Riaz Hussain
M/s Myco Engineers
Address : 65-Jafar town, Sher-e-rabbani Chowk, link Riwand Road Lahore

DEBRIEFING RECORD

Employer : **Punjab Rural Municipal Services Company (PRMSC)**
Project : **Punjab Rural Sustainable Water Supply & Sanitation Project (PRSWSSP)**
Contract title : **a) Procurement of Civil Works, North, Tehsil Noorpur Thal (Villages: Chak 29 Mb, Chak 49 Mb, Chak 53 Mb, Adhi Sergal) Contract Package-NPT-02**
b) Procurement of Civil Works, North, Tehsil Noorpur Thal (Village: Rangpur Baghor) Contract Package-NPT-03
c) Procurement of Civil Works, South-II, Tehsil Kahrur Pakka (Villages: Chalay Wehin) Contract Package-KRP-05

Country : Pakistan
Loan No. : IBRD-92670
RFB No. : PK-LG& CD-374245-CW-RFB
PK-LG& CD-374246-CW-RFB
PK-LG& CD-380683-CW-RFB

In pursuance to the Notification of Intention to Award (Notification) issued to the bidder named above on 03 April 2024, notifying our decision to award the above contract to the following successful bidder, the above-named bidder submitted a request for "Debriefing" on 03 April 2024:

As per the Notification of Intention to Award (Notification), averred to above, the Standstill Period expired on the midnight of:

Date:	08-04-2024	Local Time:	15:00 hours
-------	------------	-------------	-------------

The request for Debriefing was received within the allocated dateline and pursuant to the provisions of the Notification of Intention to Award dated 25 March 2024, PRMSC provided the necessary debriefing as per the information that was shared vide aforesaid Notification dated 25 March 2024 to the following authorized representatives of the bidder who requested the Debriefing, in person:

Name : Mr. Faisal Bin Saleem (Owner) & Mr. Muhammad Asghar (Project Manager)
M/s Ahmad & Co.
Mr. Ahmad Tarrar (Owner) M/s Tayyab Manzoor Tarrar (TMT)
Mr. Riaz Hussain (Partner) M/s Myco Engineers

On the basis of Notification of Intention to Award for the contract packages NPT-02, NPT-03 and KRP-05, M/s Ahmad & Co. was declared responsive.

M/s Ahmad & Co. was declared responsive based on our evaluation process. However, M/s Myco Engineers and M/s Tayyab Manzoor Tarrar have challenged these results.

The authorized representative of the bidders was apprised the following reason(s):

Sr. No.	Reasons	RFB Clause Ref.
---------	---------	-----------------



PUNJAB RURAL MUNICIPAL SERVICES COMPANY

(A Company registered under Section 42 of the Companies Act, 2017)



(i)	<p>The debriefing session commenced as scheduled at the PRMSC office.</p> <p>Contractors M/s Myco Engineers & M/s TMT declared that the notification of intention of award did not reflect the correct outcome, citing that the successful bidder, M/s Ahmad & Co, lacked the necessary general construction experience as per the requirements outlined in the Request for Bids (RFB) which states</p> <p><u><i>Experience under construction contracts in the role of prime contractor, JV member, subcontractor, or management contractor for at least the last ten (10) years, starting 1st January 2013.</i></u></p> <p>It was noted that Ahmad & Co's original registration with the Pakistan Engineering Council, with License Number 351, was in 2016.</p> <p>Manager Procurement clarified PRMSC's stance, stating that Ahmad & Co's registration as an old firm, with License Number 350 dating back to 2002, was considered valid.</p> <p>Contractors M/s Myco Engineers & M/s TMT contested this, leading to an impasse in the discussion, and the meeting concluded without reaching a decision.</p> <p>Subsequently, M/s Ahmad & Co attended the debriefing session and argued that PRMSC should recognize the registration date of their old firm, emphasizing that only the ownership had changed in 2016.</p> <p>Manager Procurement questioned M/s Ahmad & Co about the change in license number from 350 to 351 if only the ownership had changed.</p> <p>M/s Ahmad & Co failed to provide a satisfactory explanation, resulting in the meeting ending inconclusively with no resolution reached.</p>	Section III - Evaluation and Qualification Criteria 4.1 (a) General Construction Experience
-----	--	--

The authorized representative of the bidder was also updated that they can obtain further information related to the procurement process by accessing the World Bank's Procurement Regulations from their website at the link:

[Procurement Regulations for IPF Borrowers \(Procurement Regulations\) \[https://policies.worldbank.org/sites/ppf3/PPFDocuments/Forms/DispPage.aspx?docid=4005\]](https://policies.worldbank.org/sites/ppf3/PPFDocuments/Forms/DispPage.aspx?docid=4005)

The authorized representative of the bidder was also explained that they may wish to lodge procurement complaint in case of their unsatisfaction by taking guidance from the World Bank's related policies & procedures: "[How to make a Procurement-related Complaint](http://www.worldbank.org/en/projects-operations/products-and-services/brief/procurement-new-framework#framework)" [<http://www.worldbank.org/en/projects-operations/products-and-services/brief/procurement-new-framework#framework>] which provides a useful explanation of the process, as well as a sample letter of complaint, which obligates following essential requirements:

- 1) The bidder must be an 'interested party'. In this case, that means a Bidder who submitted a Bid in this bidding process, and is the recipient of a Notification of Intention to Award.
- 2) The complaint can only challenge the decision to award the contract.
- 3) The bidder must submit the complaint within the period stated in the Notification of Intention to Award.
- 4) The bidder must include, in their complaint, all of the information required by the Procurement Regulations (as described in Annex III).